Mongolia - Property Rights - Special Hashaa Plot

Report generated on: March 8, 2018

Visit our data catalog at: https://data.mcc.gov/evaluations/index.php

Overview

Identification

COUNTRY
Mongolia

EVALUATION TITLE
Property Rights - Special Hashaa Plot

EVALUATION TYPE
Independent Impact Evaluation

ID NUMBER
DDI-MCC-MNG-IPA-SHPS-2012-v01

Version

VERSION DESCRIPTION
Anonymized dataset for public distribution

Overview

ABSTRACT
The impact evaluation study of the MCA-M PRP will be the first fully randomized evaluation of a large-scale land titling program. Randomization will occur at the geographic level akin to a neighborhood. Mongolian cities are divided up into a number of administrative units - the smallest being the “kheseg”. Khesegs were chosen as the unit of randomization for the study because they are a well-defined unit that is small and numerous enough to allow for sufficient statistical power. The baseline estimation strategy will be a differences-in-differences approach, where we compare the outcomes of households in the treatment group with the control group as well as before and after the completion of the formalization activities. Exposure to treatment was 66% in Darkhan and Erdenet, and 50% in Ulaanbaatar districts. There are no results to report as of now because only the baseline has been conducted so far.

EVALUATION METHODOLOGY
Randomization

UNITS OF ANALYSIS
Kheseg (Neighborhood)

KIND OF DATA
Sample survey data [ssd]

TOPICS

Topic	Vocabulary	URI
Land	MCC Sector	
Gender		

KEYWORDS
Income, Property and investment, Property and saving

Coverage

GEOGRAPHIC COVERAGE
Regionally: Ulaanbaatar, Darkhan and Erdenet

UNIVERSE
Households living in hashaa plots in the ger districts of Mongolia's three largest cities: Ulaanbaatar, Darkhan, and Erdenet.

Producers and Sponsors

PRIMARY INVESTIGATOR(S)

Name	Affiliation
Innovations for Poverty Action	

FUNDING

Name	Abbreviation	Role
Millennium Challenge Corporation	MCC	

Metadata Production

METADATA PRODUCED BY

Name	Abbreviation	Affiliation	Role
Millennium Challenge Corporation	MCC		Review of Metadata
Innovations for Poverty Action	IPA		Independent Evaluator

DATE OF METADATA PRODUCTION
2014-05-08

DDI DOCUMENT VERSION
Version 1.0.

DDI DOCUMENT ID
DDI-MCC-MNG-IPA-SHPS-2012-v01

MCC Compact and Program

COMPACT OR THRESHOLD
Mongolia Compact

PROGRAM
In recent years, large numbers of rural Mongolians have migrated to Mongolia's urban centers, primarily its three biggest cities - Ulaanbaatar, Erdenet and Darkhan - where they tend to settle in underdeveloped urban areas known as ger districts.2 The majority of these migrants occupy plots of land (called hashaas) for long periods of time, typically erecting fences to mark off the plots and lay claim to them. Only in the last 10 years, however, has there been a formal mechanism by which migrants could obtain legally recognized rights to the land they occupy. Nevertheless, the current complexity of registering land and the associated expenses make it difficult for many citizens to obtain formal private titles. The MCA-M PRP aims to improve the efficiency and transparency of the formal system for privatizing and registering land rights in Mongolia and thereby provide all Mongolians with greater access to private land titles. Project funding will support the following two activities: 1. Improvement of the land privatization and registration system by: a. Establishing a commission of stakeholders and technical experts to make recommendations on how to decrease legal and institutional barriers; b. Upgrading the geospatial infrastructure used by Mongolian government agencies to survey and manage land; c. Capacity-building for land offices; and, d. Refurbishing the State Registry's central office space and establishing new offices in four districts of Ulaanbaatar, as well as eight regional centers around the country. 2. Privatization and registration of ger3 area land plots by providing direct assistance to citizens who wish to privatize their land plots in low and middle income ger district areas. The SHPS Baseline Report describes data that was collected in conjunction with an experimental evaluation of the second activity related to privatizing and registering land plots in ger areas.

MCC SECTOR
Land (Land)

PROGRAM LOGIC
Key outcomes to be evaluated include a) ownership and registration status of household plots, b) cost and time to register, c)

household income, d) land values, e) household access to credit and terms under which they receive credit, f) probability that land is bought and sold by facilitating land transactions, and g) number of households undertaking improvements to their land.

PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS

Khesegs, the equivalent of a neighborhood, were randomly selected to be targeted by the project in three districts of Ulaanbaatar, and in the cities of Darkhan and Erdenet.

Sampling

Study Population

Households living in hashaa plots in the ger districts of Mongolia's three largest cities: Ulaanbaatar, Darkhan, and Erdenet.

Sampling Procedure

8,552 plots were identified for surveying for the sample. Of these, 6,344 were occupied households and 5,816 were successfully interviewed for a response rate of 68%. 528 households refused to participate in the survey and 2,068 plots were unoccupied, had no one present at the time of any of the survey attempts, or were invalid plots. Plots found to be unoccupied or to be owned or occupied by a business or state entities were deemed unsuitable for the survey and were dropped from the sample. Geographic Information System data on all hashaa plots in the ger areas of the relevant districts of the capital and in Darkhan and Erdenet, were obtained from the PRP PIU. The ownership status of many of these plots was recorded in this GIS data set, though the ownership status information was known to be out of date and inaccurate. The boundaries of administrative units such as city, district, khoroo, and kheseg were also included. IPA processed the GIS data using ArcGIS and Stata computer software.

Once the GIS and administrative cadastral data sets were integrated, sample selection was stratified by kheseg, a geographical unit roughly equivalent to a neighborhood in the United States. First, the number of program-eligible plots per kheseg was calculated. Plots listed as “fully registered” in the GIS data were not included in this calculation since they would not be eligible for project assistance. Weights were then calculated for each kheseg unit that measured the proportion of the total number of eligible plots located in this unit. These weights were then multiplied by 8,000, the total number of plots it was deemed desirable and feasible to include in survey activities, to determine the number of plots to be sampled from each kheseg. After the sample size for each kheseg was determined, plots were randomly selected for inclusion in the survey.

Deviations from Sample Design

In November of 2010, the survey contractor selected by MCA-M began administering the questionnaire to the households residing on and/or owning the plots selected during the sampling process. Due to the anticipated errors in the Geographic Information System data, not all of the hashaa plots selected for the SHPS sample were occupied. In addition, Mongolian households are extremely mobile. To minimize these challenges, the survey teams were required to make four attempts to locate the hashaa plot to determine the registration status and an additional four attempts to complete the survey questionnaire. Unfortunately, the SHPS had to be suspended after several weeks of data collection due to unforeseen delays in project implementation. The scope of the project was subsequently adjusted and the project implementation areas shifted due to the inflexibility of the data collection contract. The scope of the project was reduced from covering all districts in Ulaanbaatar to covering only the three largest districts, Bayanzurkh, Chingeltei, and Songinokhairkhan.

Response Rate

The response rate was 68%.

Questionnaires

Overview

Household questionnaire prepared in both Mongolian and English. The team organized 4 pilot testings involving 109 respondents. Modules: - Log of attempts made to take survey, - 1. Registration section 2. Control section (filled by enumerator) 3. Introduction to survey 4. Basic Information 5. Demographic, education level and residential information of household members 6. Economic activities and incomes of household members 7. Household assets and properties 8. Planned future investments 9. Registration status of plot being surveyed 10. Implementation level of the 2003 amendment to the Land Law. 11. Accessability of land registration information and service quality at General Authority of State Registration 12. Land conflicts 13. Hashaa plot sales and its market value 14. Infrastructure of hashaa plots 15. Household spendings 16. Household business activities 17. Insurance 18. Household loans 19. Government policy and thoughts on its implementation 20. Citizens' involvement and labor in common 21. Risk evaluation

Data Collection

Data Collection Dates

Start	End	Cycle
2011-12	2013-08	Baseline

Questionnaires

Household questionnaire prepared in both Mongolian and English. The team organized 4 pilot testings involving 109 respondents. Modules: - Log of attempts made to take survey, - 1. Registration section 2. Control section (filled by enumerator) 3. Introduction to survey 4. Basic Information 5. Demographic, education level and residential information of household members 6. Economic activities and incomes of household members 7. Household assets and properties 8. Planned future investments 9. Registration status of plot being surveyed 10. Implementation level of the 2003 amendment to the Land Law. 11. Accessability of land registration information and service quality at General Authority of State Registration 12. Land conflicts 13. Hashaa plot sales and its market value 14. Infrastructure of hashaa plots 15. Household spendings 16. Household business activities 17. Insurance 18. Household loans 19. Government policy and thoughts on its implementation 20. Citizens' involvement and labor in common 21. Risk evaluation

Data Collectors

Name	Abbreviation	Affiliation
MEC LLC and MCDS LLC		

Supervision

Interviewing was conducted by teams of interviewers. There were up to 4 supervisors, 40 interviewers, hashaa registration teams that comprised of team leader and driver, and field survey teams of 6 and 8 people for Darkhan and Erdenet. There was also a survey data quality team and a database creation team led by an IT manager.The team applied 2 phased approaces: 1 phase hashaa registration and 2 phase administration of main survey. The role of the team leader was to coordinate field data collection activities, maintain relationship with MCA and IPA, manage budgets, prepare and submit reports and oversee sub-contractors. The field manager's role was to recruit data collection team, carry out interview training on data collection, entry, cleaning and processing, organize training on the use of GPS receiver sets, organize all logistics for the field, field data collection by 6 data collection teams, oversee field operation, organize data entry, data processing and handling. The supervisor was responsible for using the information collected during hashaa registration to contact the respondent and confirm a date for the questionnaire to be administered and send an interviewer accordingly. Survey team members were in charge of carrying out actual interviews respondents and following up with them if necessary. Survey data quality team were required to listen to audio recordings of all questionnaires and checking it against hard copy and to check Data Quality Monitor'scomments and fix the errors in data files. Database creation team were in charge of scanning questionnaires, doing data entry, checking data entry against original PDF file, database logical control and translating database into English.

Data Processing

Data Editing

IDs in the dataset were checked against the original sample frame to make sure that they were correctly entered and complete. In addition,team leaders manually inspected each survey to ensure accuarcy of data collected and for logicallly consistancy. Back checks were also performed.

Other Processing

Data entry was conducted by 8 operators of the Database Creation team. The team used ABBYY FlexiCapture Standalone and Distributed version for data entry automated solutions for the questionnaires. Templates of the questionnaire and answer sheets were created using a special program. Then the IT manager created an auto recognition definition template using Document Definition Editor or ABBYY FlexiCapture 9.0 which will automatically identify pages and document types. Two different operators made data entry #1 and data entry #2. The third operator checked and corrected incorrect values for logical and validation rules. After checking every character and group field correction all variables were recognized and verified. Then the data was exported into MS Excel MS Access. The export document includes the imported, recognized, verified and exported dates. Then the third operator compared the database #1 to database #2 to identify differences. After checking the database errors, the third operator provided a logical control using a filter. Finally, an english version of the database is created. The final database is then imported into STATA. There were no problems in the course of finalizing the database.

In addition, Innovations for Poverty Action took a random sample of 1500 data points and manually checked them against the paper copies of the questionnaires. The data was accepted from the data collection contractor when the error rate found by the manual check was below 0.5%.

Data Appraisal

No content available